Stimulated infrared thermography applied to the local thermal characterization of fresco

By K. Mouhoubi*, J.L Bodnar*, V. Detalle**, J.M. Vallet***

* URCA / GRESPI / ECATHERM, UFR Sciences Exactes et Naturelles, BP 1039, 51687 Reims cedex 02, France, kmouhoubi@gmail.com, jl.bodnar@univ-reims.fr.

** LRMH, 29 avenue du Paris, 77420 Champs sur Marne, France, vincent.detalle@culture.gouv.fr. *** CICRP, 21 rue Guibal, 13003 Marseille, France, jean-marc.vallet@cicrp.fr.

Abstract

In this work, we present a new method for estimating the local thermal diffusivity of fresco. This method uses a temporal analysis of the thermal response of a work of art submitted to a local laser excitation. First, we present the principle of the estimation method. Then, we show theoretically with the help of numerical simulations, the feasibility of the method. Finally, we show experimentally, that the method allows a good estimation of the thermal diffusivity of an academic plaster sample and of an academic fresco.

1. Introduction

The field of restoration and conservation of heritage artworks requests various non-destructive and characterization techniques. Among these NDT methods we can cite stimulated infrared thermography. The scientific literature already shows that this method is very efficient for the detection and localization of structural changes affecting the heritage artwork such as delamination [1-50]. The request of geometric characterization of these defects pushes the research teams to develop thermophysical properties estimation tools usable in situ. For example, wanting estimate by stimulated infrared thermography, the depth of a delamination, requires local knowledge of the thermal diffusivity of the artwork. In previous studies [51 - 53], we proposed three methods for local measurement of thermal diffusivity. They used a local laser excitation associated with a mathematical post treatment. The principles of these techniques were the followings: In the first case [51], the post treatment implemented, was an analysis of the spatial Fourier transform of the infrared thermogram obtained. In the second case [52], the post treatment was a temporal analysis of the characteristic radius of the thermal signature of the laser spot. Finally, in the third case [53], the post treatment was carried out in the temporal analysis of the maximum temperature of the thermal signature. The work presented here, aims to purpose a fourth estimation method. First it uses as the previous ones, a local laser excitation, providing an in situ analysis. Then it analyzes the temporal evolution of the area located under the spatial profile of the thermal signature of the laser spot. In this paper we present the results then obtained. We present first the principle of the estimation method. Then, we show theoretically, using numerical simulations, the feasibility of the method. Finally, we show experimentally that the method allows a good estimation of the thermal diffusivity of an academic plaster sample and of an academic fresco

2. Local thermal diffusivity measurement method

The principle of the local thermal diffusivity measurement method developed for the study is the following: A sample is subjected on its front face to a localized laser excitation. This excitation is temporally close to a Dirac function δ (t) and is spatially Gaussian shape. The measurement of the spatiotemporal evolution of the temperature field induced by this excitation, using an infrared camera and a mathematical post-processing leads an estimation of the thermal diffusivity of the studied material. Let us examine the mathematical post-processing which is based on this measurement technique. Given a plate having thickness L. It is radially semi-infinite. Given a very short thermal excitation (Dirac function δ (t)). Its spatial shape is Gaussian. At the initial time t = 0 s, this excitation is applied in the center of the plate in order to eliminate edge effects. Given R, the characteristic radius of this exciting spot (measured at Q_{max} / e^2). Given λ , ρ , C and a, respectively, the thermal conductivity, the density, the heat capacity and the thermal diffusivity of the studied material. The sample is initially in thermal balance with its environment. Finally, in this model we neglect the radiative - convective exchanges between the studied sample and the environment. The mathematical translation of these hypotheses leads to the following differential system (1):

$$\Delta T(r, z, t) = \frac{1}{a} \cdot \frac{\partial T(r, z, t)}{\partial t}$$
(1)

For
$$z = 0$$
: $-\lambda \frac{\partial T(r,0,t)}{\partial z} = \frac{2Q}{\pi R^2} Exp(-\frac{2r^2}{R^2})\delta(t)$
For $z = L$: $-\lambda \frac{\partial T(r,L,t)}{\partial z} = 0$
For $t = 0$: $T = T_{ext}$

Solving this differential system uses two integral transformations; firstly a zero order Hankel transformation along the r axis (2)

$$H_0[\frac{1}{r}\frac{\partial}{\partial r}(r\frac{\partial T(r,z,t)}{\partial r})] = -\sigma^2 \int_0^\infty r.J_0(\sigma.r)T(r,z,t).dr$$
(2)

And secondly, a Fourier transform along the time axis (3).

$$F(\frac{\partial T(r,z,t)}{\partial t}) = \frac{i.\omega}{\sqrt{2.\pi}} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} T(r,z,t) \exp(-i.\omega t) dt$$
(3)

Both integral transformations allow to obtain the expression of the spatio-temporal evolution of the temperature in front of the studied sample given by the formula (4).

$$T(r,0,t) \approx \frac{2Q}{b\sqrt{\pi^{3}t}} \cdot \frac{1}{R^{2} + 8at} \cdot \exp(-\frac{2r^{2}}{R^{2} + 8at})$$
(4)

Note

$$T_{max}(0,0,t) \approx \frac{2Q}{b\sqrt{\pi^3 t}} \cdot \frac{1}{R^2 + 8at}$$
 (5)

And calculate the spatial integral of (4). We obtain the formula (6):

$$I(t) = \frac{1}{2} T_{\max}(0,0,t) \cdot (R^2 + 8at) \cdot \sqrt{\frac{\pi}{2}} \cdot erf\left(\sqrt{\frac{2}{R^2 + 8at}} \cdot r\right)$$
(6)

Let us now study the specifications of the "error function". Figure 1 shows that this function tends to 1 when its argument is greater than 2.



Fig 1. The error function properties

In our case study, it gives:

$$r^{2}> 2 (R^{2} + 8at)$$
 (7)

Considering now a radius of excitation R equal to 1.8 mm, a thermal diffusivity of the studied sample equal to $3.5 \, 10^{-7} \, m^2$ /s and an analyze duration equal to 1s ((these are the experimental conditions usually considered in our study), this formula becomes :

It is therefore possible to ignore the error function in expression (6) as soon as the integration boundary will be greater than 1.6 R. With these conditions, formula (6) becomes formula (9)

$$I(t) = \frac{1}{2} T_{\max}(0,0,t) \cdot (R^2 + 8at) \cdot \sqrt{\frac{\pi}{2}}$$
(9)

Which can be written (10)

$$M(t) = R^{2} + 8at = \frac{2}{\pi} \left(\frac{I(t)}{T_{\max}(0,0,t)} \right)^{2}$$
(10)

This expression shows the possibility to estimate the thermal diffusivity of the studied sample from the estimation of the slope of the temporal evolution of the ratio of the spatial integral of the thermal signature of the laser spot and the maximum temperature of this signature.

3. Theoretical study

To test this new technique of local thermal diffusivity measurement, we have developed mathematical simulations. The latter use the finite element method to solve the above differential system (1). Simulations conditions selected for the study are the followings: First, we have considered a 3D geometry. Then we considered a block of plaster, with thermo-physical properties similar to those of a real mural painting. We considered a thermal conductivity equal to 0.4 W / m K, a density equal to 1100 kg / m3, a specific heat equal to 830 J / kg K and a thermal diffusivity equal to $4,38.10^{-7} \text{ m}^2 / \text{s}$. For simplify the study, the shape of the plaster block was chosen rectangular. Its dimensions are a length equal to 12 cm, a width equal to 12 cm and a thickness equal to 3 mm. An excitation was applied in the center of the plaster block. The temporal shape of this excitation is a Gaussian. The characteristic radius of excitation is equal 1.8 mm. The exciting power used is equal to 3 W. These values correspond to those conventionally available by experience. Finally, to reduce the computation time, we

considered a progressive mesh of the studied sample. It was taken thinner at the location of the laser excitation and wider elsewhere. From thermograms calculated at each moment, we have drawn spatial profiles of temperature measured at the location of the laser excitation. We then calculated the M (t) function. The figure 2 presents an example of result obtained. It shows like theoretically expected, an increasing straight line. We finally estimate the thermal diffusivity from the slope of the M (t) function. We obtain a slope equal to $3.5 \, 10^{-6} \, m^2/s$, which leads to a thermal diffusivity equal to $4,37 \, 10^{-7} \, m^2/s$. The theoretical value is equal to $4,38.10^{-7} \, m^2/s$. These values are very close, which shows the feasibility of the method.



Fig 2. Time evolution of the spatial integral of the thermal signature of the laser excitation

4. Experimental study

4.1. The experimental device implemented

The results obtained in the theoretical study being encouraging, we switched in a second step to an experimental study. The experimental setup used is the SAMMTHIR device of the GRESPI/CATHERM laboratory. The excitation source is a laser diode. The wavelength of emission is equal to 810 nm. It is associated with collimation and focusing optics. The infrared optical acquisition is a FLIR "long-wave" bolometers camera. It is used in a macro mode (to obtain a sufficient spatial resolution). The latter is placed perpendicularly to the sample. The distance between the camera and the sample is equal to about 5 cm. The laser beam, due to the size of the camera, lights the studied sample in a tilted way. The laser spot is then slightly elliptical. The duration of excitation is equal 20 ms. Its power is equal to 2W. The acquisition frequency of the infrared thermography camera is equal to 50 Hz.



Fig 3. The experimental device used for the study

4.2. Study of a sample academic

The first sample analyzed, is an academic sample. It is a plaster sample. It is a parallelepiped block. Its length is equal to 15 cm. Its wide is equal to 12 cm. Its thickness is equal to 2.3 cm. To determine its real thermal diffusivity, we have used a metrological laboratory rear face flash diffusivimeter. An example of obtained result is presented with this metrological device is presented in Figure 4. It shows that the best fit theory / experience is obtained for a thermal diffusivity equal to $3.49.10^{-7}$ m² / s.



Fig 4. Characterization of the academic sample using a metrological laboratory flash diffusivimeter

This plaster sample was then analyzed using the experimental device SAMMTHIR. From the photothermal response obtained, we drawn first spatial profiles of the spot laser thermal signature at different moments. We estimate then thermal diffusivity value using our analyze method. An example of obtained result is presented in Figure 5. It shows like theoretically expected, an increasing straight line. Its slope value is estimated equal to 2.74 10^{-6} m²/s. Its thermal diffusivity is then estimated equal to 3.43 10^{-7} m² / s. This value is close to the reference value. This confirms experimentally the feasibility of the method.



Fig 5. Characterization of a plaster sample using the SAMMTHIR system

4.3. Study of an academic fresco

Following this encouraging first experimental study, we studied in a second step, an academic fresco. This is a copy of the "Saint Christophe" from the "Campana" collection of the Louvre (Figure 6).



Fig 6. The academic fresco studied

This academic fresco has been already analyzed and characterized three times. In the first case, we have used a spatial Fourier analysis [51]. In the second case, we have used a temporal analysis of the radius of the thermal signature of the laser spot [52]. In the third case, we used a temporal analysis of the maximum temperature of this same signature [53]. In all cases the analysis was developed at the place of the right eye of the infant Jesus. The thermal diffusivity values then estimated was equal respectively to: 5,13 10⁻⁷ m²s⁻¹ [51], 5,09 10⁻⁷ m²s⁻¹ [52] and finally 4.96 10⁻⁷ m²s⁻¹ [53]. It is always for this position we have developed our new analysis. We used the same experimental protocol as for the study of the academic plaster sample. We present in Figure 7 the temporal evolution of the ratio calculated between the spatial integral of the thermal signature of the laser spot and its maximum value. It shows like theoretically expected, an increasing straight line. Its slope value is estimated equal to 4.08 10⁻⁶ m²/s. Its thermal diffusivity is then estimated equal to 5.10 10⁻⁷ m² / s. This value is close to the reference value. This confirms experimentally once more time, the feasibility of the method.



Fig 7. Characterization of an academic fresco using the SAMMTHIR system

5. Conclusion

In this work, we studied the possibilities of the stimulated infrared thermography for in situ estimation of mural painting thermal diffusivity. We presented first the principle of the measuring method. It is based on a temporal analysis of the thermal signature of a laser spot. We then presented simulations developed for the study and shown theoretically that the photothermal method allowed a good estimation of the local thermal diffusivity of a plaster block. The theoretical results obtained being positive, we developed an experimental study. We then presented the experimental device developed for the study. Finally we have shown experimentally that the method gave access to a good estimation of the local thermal diffusivity of a partial copy of the "Saint Christophe" of the "Campana" collection of the Louvre. These theoretical and experimental results seem to open the way for the photothermal *in situ* characterization of mural painting. They now need to be sharpen and generalize, to be implemented during of real works of art. Studies in this direction are in progress.

REFERENCES

- [1] D. Ambrosini, C. Daffara, R. Di Biase, D. Paoletti, L. Pezzati, R. Bellucci, et F. Bettini, « Integrated reflectography and thermography for wooden paintings diagnostics », Journal of Cultural Heritage, vol. 11, nº 2, p. 196-204, avr. 2010.
- [2] N. Avdelidis et A. Moropoulou, « Applications of infrared thermography for the investigation of historic structures », Journal of Cultural Heritage, vol. 5, nº 1, p. 119–127, 2004.
- [3] E. Barreira et V. P. de Freitas, « Evaluation of building materials using infrared thermography », Construction and Building Materials, vol. 21, n° 1, p. 218–224, 2007.
- [4] P. Bison, A. Bortolin, G. Cadelano, G. Ferrarini, L. Finesso, F. Lopez, X. Maldague, C. S. U. ITC-CNR, et C. S. U. ISIB-CNR, « Evaluation of frescoes detachments by partial least square thermography ».
- [5] P. Bison, A. Bortolin, G. Cadelano, G. Ferrarini, F. López, et X. Maldague, « Comparison of image processing techniques for the on-site evaluation of damaged frescoes », in SPIE Sensing Technology+ Applications, 2014, p. 91050E–91050E.
- [6] K. Blessley, C. Young, J. Nunn, J. Coddington, et S. Shepard, « The feasibility of flash thermography for the examination and conservation of works of art », Studies in Conservation, vol. 55, nº 2, p. 107–120, 2010.
- [7] J.L. Bodnar, J.L. Nicolas, J.C. Candoré, V. Detalle : ¶Non-destructive testing by infrared thermography under random excitation and ARMA analysis, International Journal of Thermophysics, 2012, vol 33, pp 2011-2015.
- [8] J.L Bodnar, J. C Candoré, J.L. Nicolas, G. Szatanik, V. Detalle, J.M.Vallet : Stimulated infrared thermography applied to help for restoration of mural paintings, NDT/E International, 49, pp 40-46, 2012
- [9] J.L. Bodnar, K. Mouhoubi, G. Szatanik-Perrier, J.M. Vallet, V. Detalle : Photothermal thermography applied to the non-destructive testing of different types of works of art, International Journal of Thermophysics, ¶2012, vol 33, pp 1996-2000.
- [10] J.L Bodnar, J.L. Nicolas, K. Mouhoubi, V. Detalle : Stimulated infrared thermography applied to thermophysical characterization of cultural heritage mural paintings, European physical journal : Applied physics, 2012, 60, 21003.
- [11] J. L. Bodnar, J. L. Nicolas, K. Mouhoubi, J. C. Candore, et V. Detalle, « Characterization of an Inclusion of Plastazote Located in an Academic Fresco by Photothermal Thermography », International journal of thermophysics, vol. 34, nº 8-9, p. 1633–1637, 2013.
- [12] J.L. Bodnar, K. Mouhoubi, L. Di Pallo, V. Detalle, J.M. Vallet, T. Duvaut : Contribution to the improvement of heritage mural painting non-destructive testing by stimulated infrared thermography, European physical journal : Applied physics, 2013, 64, 11001
- [13] J.C. Candoré : Détection et caractérisation de défauts par thermographie infrarouge stimulée : Application au contrôle d'œuvres d'art. PhD, Reims, June 2010.
- [14] J. C. Candoré, J. L. Bodnar, V. Detalle, et P. Grossel, « Non-destructive testing of works of art by stimulated infrared thermography », The European Physical Journal Applied Physics, vol. 57, nº 02, p. 21002, 2012.
- [15] J. C. Candoré, J.L Bodnar, V. Detalle, P. Grossel : Non destructive testing of work of art by stimulated infrared thermography. European physical journal Applied Physics, 2012, vol 57, 02, pp 21002 -210011.
- [16] B. Cannas, S. Carcangiu, G. Concu, et N. Trulli, « Modeling of Active Infrared Thermography for Defect Detection in Concrete Structures ».
- [17] G. M. Carlomagno et C. Meola, « Comparison between thermographic techniques for frescoes NDT », NDT & E International, vol. 35, nº 8, p. 559–565, 2002.
- [18] J.-P. Chambard et A. Roche, « Defect detection of wall paintings in the Chateau de Versailles using TVholography and IR thermography », in Optical Metrology, 2007, p. 66180Y–66180Y.

- [19] K. Chatterjee, S. Tuli, S. G. Pickering, et D. P. Almond, « A comparison of the pulsed, lock-in and frequency modulated thermography nondestructive evaluation techniques », NDT & E International, vol. 44, nº 7, p. 655-667, nov. 2011.
- [20] C. Daffara, L. Pezzati, D. Ambrosini, D. Paoletti, R. Di Biase, P. I. Mariotti, et C. Frosinini, « Wide-band IR imaging in the NIR-MIR-FIR regions for in situ analysis of frescoes », 2011, p. 808406-808406-12.
- [21] G. Doni, N. Orazi, F. Mercuri, C. Cicero, U. Zammit, S. Paoloni, et M. Marinelli, « Thermographic study of the illuminations of a 15th century antiphonary », Journal of Cultural Heritage, vol. 15, nº 6, p. 692-697, nov. 2014.
- [22] T. Fricke-Begemann, G. Gülker, K. D. Hinsch, et H. Joost, « Remote localization of debonded areas in historical murals by TV-holography », Non-Destructive Testing and Microanalysis for the Diagnostics and Conservation of the Cultural and Environmental Heritage, Proceedings of art, vol. 99, p. 247–255.
- [23] D. Gavrilov, R. G. Maev, et D. P. Almond, « A review of imaging methods in analysis of works of art: Thermographic imaging method in art analysis », Canadian Journal of Physics, vol. 92, nº 4, p. 341-364, avr. 2014.
- [24] R. Gr et D. GAVRILOV, « Thermography in Analysis of Works of Art: Choice of the Optimal Approach ».
- [25] E. Grinzato, P. Bison, S. Marinetti, et V. Vavilov, « Nondestructive evaluation of delaminations in fresco plaster using transient infrared thermography », Res Nondestr Eval, vol. 5, nº 4, p. 257-274, déc. 1994.
- [26] E. Grinzato, P. G. Bison, et S. Marinetti, « Monitoring of ancient buildings by the thermal method », Journal of Cultural Heritage, vol. 3, nº 1, p. 21-29, avr. 2002.
- [27] E. Grinzato, « IR thermography applied to historical buildings », Proc. QIRT 02 (Dubrovnik), p. 3–14, 2002.
- [28] E. Grinzato, P. G. Bison, C. Bressan, et A. Mazzoldi, « NDE of frescoes by infrared thermography and lateral heating », in Eurotherm Seminar, 1998, vol. 60, p. 64–67.
- [29] K. Janssens, J. Dik, M. Cotte, et J. Susini, « Photon-based techniques for nondestructive subsurface analysis of painted cultural heritage artifacts », Accounts of chemical research, vol. 43, nº 6, p. 814–825, 2010.
- [30] Y. H. Jo et C. H. Lee, « Quantitative modeling of blistering zones by active thermography for deterioration evaluation of stone monuments », Journal of Cultural Heritage, vol. 15, nº 6, p. 621-627, nov. 2014.
- [31] J. R. Kominsky et T. F. Martin, « Passive Infrared Thermography—A Qualitative Method for Detecting Moisture Anomalies in Building Envelopes ».
- [32] F. López, S. Sfarra, C. Ibarra-Castanedo, D. Ambrosini, et X. P. V. Maldague, « Role of the masonry in paintings during a seismic event analyzed by infrared vision », présenté à Proceedings of SPIE - The International Society for Optical Engineering, 2015, vol. 9527.
- [33] C. Meola, R. Di Maio, N. Roberti, et G. M. Carlomagno, « Application of infrared thermography and geophysical methods for defect detection in architectural structures », Engineering Failure Analysis, vol. 12, nº 6, p. 875-892, déc. 2005.
- [34] F. Mercuri, C. Cicero, N. Orazi, S. Paoloni, M. Marinelli, et U. Zammit, « Infrared Thermography Applied to the Study of Cultural Heritage », International Journal of Thermophysics, p. 1–6, 2014.
- [35] F. Mercuri, U. Zammit, N. Orazi, S. Paoloni, M. Marinelli, et F. Scudieri, « Active infrared thermography applied to the investigation of art and historic artefacts », Journal of thermal analysis and calorimetry, vol. 104, nº 2, p. 475–485, 2011.
- [36] B. F. Miller, « The feasibility of using thermography to detect subsurface voids in painted wooden panels », Journal of the American Institute for Conservation, vol. 16, n° 2, p. 27–35, 1977.
- [37] A. Moropoulou, N. P. Avdelidis, M. Koui, E. T. Delegou, et T. Tsiourva, « Infrared thermographic assessment of materials and techniques for the protection of cultural heritage », in Multispectral Image Processing and Pattern Recognition, 2001, p. 313–318.
- [38] A. Pelagotti, A. Mastio, A. Rosa, et A. Piva, « Multispectral imaging of paintings », IEEE Signal Processing Magazine, vol. 25, nº 4, p. 27-36, juill. 2008.
- [39] E. Rosina et E. C. Robison, « Applying infrared thermography to historic wood-framed buildings in North America », APT bulletin, vol. 33, nº 4, p. 37–44, 2002.
- [40] S. Sfarra, C. Ibarra-Castanedo, D. Ambrosini, D. Paoletti, A. Bendada, et X. Maldague, « Integrated approach between pulsed thermography, near-infrared reflectography and sandwich holography for wooden panel paintings advanced monitoring », Russ J Nondestruct Test, vol. 47, nº 4, p. 284-293, avr. 2011.
- [41] S. Sfarra, C. Ibarra-Castanedo, S. Ridolfi, G. Cerichelli, D. Ambrosini, D. Paoletti, et X. Maldague, « Holographic Interferometry (HI), Infrared Vision and X-Ray Fluorescence (XRF) spectroscopy for the assessment of painted wooden statues: a new integrated approach », Appl. Phys. A, vol. 115, nº 3, p. 1041-1056, juin 2014.
- [42] S. Sfarra, P. Theodorakeas, C. Ibarra-Castanedo, N. P. Avdelidis, A. Paoletti, D. Paoletti, K. Hrissagis, A. Bendada, M. Koui, et X. Maldague, « Importance of integrated results of different non-destructive techniques in order to evaluate defects in panel paintings: the contribution of infrared, optical and ultrasonic techniques », 2011, vol. 8084, p. 80840R-80840R-13.
- [43] S. Sfarra, C. Ibarra-Castanedo, D. Ambrosini, D. Paoletti, A. Bendada, et X. Maldague, « Defects detection and non-destructive testing (NDT) techniques in paintings: a unified approach through measurements of deformation », in SPIE Optical Metrology 2013, 2013, p. 87900G–87900G.

- [44] G. S. Spagnolo, G. Guattari, E. Grinzato, P. G. Bison, D. Paoletti, et D. Ambrosini, « Frescoes diagnostics by electro-optic holography and infrared thermography », in 6th World Conference on NDT and Microanalysis in Diagnostics and Conservation of Cultural and Environnemental Heritage, Rome, 1999, p. 385–398.
- [45] J. Spodek et E. Rosina, « Application of infrared thermography to historic building investigation », Journal of Architectural Conservation, vol. 15, nº 1, p. 65–81, 2009.
- [46] G. Szatanik : Etude et restauration d'une peinture murale représentant Saint Christophe (collection Campana, Louvre). Essai d'application de la thermographie infrarouge stimulée pour l'examen du support. INP, Sept 2004.
- [47] P. Theodorakeas, S. Sfarra, C. Ibarra-Castanedo, N. P. Avdelidis, M. Koui, X. P. V. Maldague, D. Ambrosini, et D. Paoletti, « The use of Pulsed Thermography for the investigation of art and cultural heritage objects ».
- [48] P. Theodorakeas, N. P. Avdelidis, E. Cheilakou, et M. Koui, « Quantitative analysis of plastered mosaics by means of active infrared thermography », Construction and Building Materials, vol. 73, p. 417–425, 2014.
- [49] V. Tornari, E. Bernikola, E. Tsiranidou, K. Hatzigiannakis, M. Andrianakis, V. Detalle, J.L Bodnar : Micromapping of defect structural micro-morphology in the documentation of fresco wallpaintings, International Journal of Heritage in the Digital Era, vol 2, n° 1, 2013, pp 1 – 23.
- Journal of Heritage in the Digital Era, vol 2, n° 1, 2013, pp 1 23.
 [50] P. Vázquez, C. Thomachot-Schneider, K. Mouhoubi, G. Fronteau, M. Gommeaux, D. Benavente, V. Barbin, J.L. Bodnar : Infrared Thermography monitoring of the NaCl crystallisation process, Infrared Physics & Technology, 71, 2015, pp 198 207.
- [51] J.C. Candoré, J.L Bodnar, V. Detalle, P. Grossel : Characterization of defects situated in a fresco by stimulated infrared thermography, European physical journal Applied Physics, 2012, vol 57, 01, pp 11002 -11008
- [52] J.L Bodnar, J.L. Nicolas, K. Mouhoubi, V. Detalle : Stimulated infrared thermography applied to thermophysical characterization of cultural heritage mural paintings, February 2012, vol 57, issue 2.
- [53] K. Mouhoubi, J.L Bodnar, J.L. Nicolas, V. Detalle, J.M. Vallet, T. Duvaut : Contribution to the local thermophysical characterization of murals paintings of the inheritance by stimulated infra-red thermography, proc of QIRT 2014, Bordeaux, 7-11 juillet 2014.